

Notice of Public Meeting of a Public Body  
**NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING OF THE  
ARIZONA NATURAL RESOURCES REVIEW COUNCIL**

Pursuant to A.R.S. Section 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Arizona Natural Resources Review Council and to the general public that the Council will hold a meeting open to the public:

**Arizona Natural Resources Review Council**

**Date: April 21st, 2014; 1:00-4:00pm**

**Location: Governor's Executive Tower  
2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Conference Room  
1700 W. Washington Street  
Phoenix, AZ 85007**

---

**1. Call to Order- Welcome and Introductions**

Acting Chairman Henry Darwin called the meeting to order at 1:00 pm and welcomed the Council and public to the meeting of the Natural Resources Review Council. Council members in attendance included:

AZ Game & Fish Department (AGFD) – Simone Westbrook Hall for Larry Voyles, Director & Chairman  
AZ State Land Department (ASLD) – Vanessa Hickman, Commissioner  
AZ Department of Environmental Quality (ADEQ) – Henry Darwin, Director  
AZ Department of Water Resources (ADWR) – Michael Lacey, Director  
AZ State Forester (ASF) – Scott Hunt, State Forester  
AZ Geological Survey (AGS) – Lee Allison, Director  
AZ State Parks (ASP) – Jay Ream for Bryan Martin, Director  
AZ Department of Agriculture (ADA) – Brett Cameron, Asst. Director  
AZ Department of Transportation (ADOT) – Absent

Staff Present in Support of the Council:

Kevin Kinsall, Natural Resources Policy Advisor to Governor Jan Brewer

Simone Westbrook Hall, Administrator, Natural Resources Review Council

**2. Review Agenda**

No requests for changes to the agenda were identified by the Council.

**3. Discussion and Formal Adoption of the Interim Report**

Ms. Simone Westbrook Hall presented the draft final report in a PowerPoint presentation for review and discussion. She noted that her presentation would be very true to the report. She explained that the report included an abbreviated executive summary along with 5 independent subcommittee reports (attached). She proceeded to summate the goal and scope of work within each of the subcommittee reports and then described the recommendations that each of the subcommittees developed for the Council. Ms. Westbrook Hall's presentation of the recommendations included:

1. Creation of a prototype decision support system a.k.a. the Natural Resource Decision Support System (NRDSS). She explained that this system would include multiple modules including a statewide geospatial (GIS) planning and management tool, a repository of state and federal mapping data and documents, and a Single Point of Contact (SPOC) for federal agency notifications as well as a dissemination system to notify state agencies or future users of pending federal actions. The NRDSS would also have search and browse capabilities and a multi-user interface.
2. Ms. Westbrook Hall described the GIS subcommittee's recommendations - including the creation of sophisticated GIS planning tool – and using the State's current GIS Clearinghouse AZGEO as a host portal in the immediate future while technical staff identifies its current

capabilities and future needs. She explained that the proposals include integrating disparate software and formats from different agencies into a federated (multi-layer) and interoperable planning system for the Governor and provide the state with tools to respond preemptively to federal actions in a way that also could serve as a model for other western states.

3. She explained that the GIS and Clearinghouse Subcommittees' recommendations would include a co-implementation process to reduce redundancy and make certain that end products are compatible. She explained to the Council that this would require quick identification of current state resources (e.g. capabilities of existing web-based platforms such as AZGEO) and future budget needs.
4. Ms. Westbrook Hall explained that these systems could go onto support a statewide mitigation and conservation banking program. The Subcommittee report recommends that the Council continue to identify ways to include ASLD lands into revenue-generating mitigation programs such as the AGFD In-Lieu-Fee Program as well as the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's Candidate Conservation Agreements with Assurances Program. The recommendations also include having ASLD inventory and ground truth natural resource characteristics on state trust land that would assist the needs of stakeholders for programs such as these. ASLD would need to secure funding and resources for completing these tasks. Ms. Hall stated that not only would the State and Governor benefit from these recommendations, but that in the future, private industry and project proponents could save time and money in the pre-scoping/planning processes and provide some them with some degree of certainty by using established pre-approved credits.
5. Ms. Westbrook Hall presented the intent and recommendations of the Planning Subcommittee. She explained that by having Counties identify desired outcomes regarding federal land planning, they position the state to act with greater consistency. She said the team focused on the Natural Resource Study Grants and that those grants would provide counties with the ability to identify their specific natural resource priorities – thereby substantiating their position in the federal review process. She explained that the subcommittee's recommendations would follow the first analysis and presentation of the Eastern Arizona Counties Organization (ECO) who was awarded the grant. She introduced Pascal Berlioux, Executive Director of the ECO. Mr. Berlioux gave a brief update on the Arizona FY2014 Natural Resources Study Grants and distributed a handout listing the calendar of workshops, as part of the Planning Subcommittee section of the presentation.
6. The Engagement and Partnering will require further recommendation work, once the Council adopts the Interim Report. And the subcommittee has created a preliminary presentation that is attached to their subcommittee report.

Chairman Darwin asked whether the Council would like to discuss anything contained in the report or any of the recommendations. Mr. Lee Allison stated that the presentation was well done. He also noted that the implementation of the plan would not require any agency to give up their data, and that the state could be one of the first states to create a sophisticated planning tool and digital SPOC.

**MOTION:** Mr. Lee Allison moved and Ms. Vanessa Hickman seconded TO MAKE THE INTERIM REPORT FINAL, AND ADOPT THE RECOMMENDATIONS.

**VOTE:** Unanimous

Ms. Simone Westbrook Hall said that she will have the Interim Report and the PowerPoint presentation posted on the Arizona Natural Resources Review Council website: [http://www.azgfd.gov/inside\\_azgfd/natResRevCouncil.html](http://www.azgfd.gov/inside_azgfd/natResRevCouncil.html); It is accessible from the Governor's website or the AGFD website.

The question was brought up to verify whether the subcommittees are still intact, and that the next natural step in the process of the Council would be to prepare for an implementation plan. Chairman Darwin asked Ms. Westbrook Hall if that would be something the Council should discuss. She indicated that yes, direction from the Council along with advisement from the Governor's office would be appropriate next step. It was noted that the Clearinghouse subcommittee needs a new chairman since Bob Broscheid has left. Chairman Henry Darwin suggested Simone Hall to fill the position and she

agreed. Chairman Darwin tasked the subcommittees to come up with a schedule of dates for each implementation and asked Ms. Hall to work out an implementation format. Each subcommittee will take that form and bring it back to the Council with their recommendation. Committee chairs can fill vacancies in each subcommittee.

#### 4. Discussion State Agencies' Inventories of Federal Action

- **AZ Dept of Agriculture** – Clean Water Act proposed rule Waters of the U.S. - along the Gila River as far as distribution of water, and that the Cattle-Growers are concerned with the possibility of a national park being created that is larger than the Grand Canyon.
- **AZ Dept of Water Resources** – Grand Canyon, rules for lower Colorado River water pumping, generator, environmental assessment for 3 parcels on Mojave Reservation, scoping for the tier 1 environmental impact statement for I95 and reallocation of water.
- **AZ State Land Dept** - Sonoran Desert Conservation Area, lower San Pedro River conservation area, proposed listing from U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service regarding the desert tortoise, shovel-nose snake; will coordinate with AGFD.
- **AZ Dept of Environmental Quality** – concerns on the newly proposed rule on Waters of the U.S.; they will be commenting and would be happy to get together with other agencies to discuss concerns.
- **AZ Game & Fish** –also looking at the proposed rule on Waters of the U.S.; perhaps it should be put on a future agenda. The Department has approximately 400 federal actions that they are currently monitoring including Forest Service and USFWS actions – with some of the larger issues that the Dept. has been engaged in include expansion of the Wolf Recovery Area and the Jaguar Critical Habitat designation.
- **AZ State Parks** – watching two environmental impact statements; one regarding southern Arizona properties and one regarding clean air act by the Patagonia Mountains and the Wildcat mining. They are also monitoring the Jaguar Critical Habitat
- **AZ State Forester** – first phase of the forest restoration project and national forests planned revisions. The Flagstaff watershed protection project that is funded by the City of Flagstaff bond money to protect the watershed that feeds Flagstaff. Also, Tonto's travel management plans, which may concern Game & Fish and the Bureau of Land Management due to possible road closures.
- **AZ Geological Survey** – Oil & Gas Conservation Committee, watching EPA's decision regarding hydraulic fracturing. Also watching the other Kinder-Morgan pipeline to move CO2 to New Mexico, with a small part in Arizona. Nuclear Regulatory Commission is doing a reassessment of the seismic hazards at Palo Verde Nuclear Generating Station in response to the event in Japan 2-3 years ago. Also watching the Petrified Forest National Park and what they are doing that may impact potash mining that underlies privately owned land and ASLD lands within park boundaries.

Chairman Henry Darwin asked the Council how confident they were that everything just discussed would have been identified in the Clearinghouse, as they had just finalized a report that is supposed to be the mechanism by which they disseminate and comment on federal actions. Discussion ensued regarding the digital SPOC they are creating, with twenty federal agencies participating, and how some cultivation is still needed.

#### 5. Legislative Update

Ms. Simone Westbrook Hall stated that the Legislature is still in full swing. The only Council-related bill that was still on the radar was SB1292, relating to the Arizona Natural Resources Advisory Council, that was transmitted to the Governor last week with no opposition. She explained that the bill establishes a

15-member Advisory Council to advise on federal land management issues and anything else asked of them by the Governor or Legislature. She said the bill is related to BLM RACs. This was the only NRRC-related bill that has made it to the Governor's desk thus far and she said she is not aware of any reason that it would not be signed.

#### **6. Review Action Items/Future Agenda Items**

The following action items and future agenda items were identified:

- 1) List of subcommittee members that they are currently aware of along with the vacancies; this is an opportunity for the Council members to designate/appoint new subcommittee members (Simone Westbrook Hall is to send this out to Council Members and Subcommittee Chairs).
- 2) Attachment to include the draft template on implementation (Simone Westbrook Hall)

**Call to the Public:** There were no requests to speak from the Public.

#### **7. Adjourn**

The Council adjourned the meeting at approximately 2:15 pm.

*The Council may vote to go into Executive Session, which is not open to the public, to discuss certain matters on any of the above agenda items. Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation, such as a sign language interpreter or this document in an alternative format, by contacting Simone Westbrook Hall, 5000 West Carefree Highway, Phoenix, Arizona 85086, 623-236-7276. Requests should be made as early as possible to arrange the accommodation.*